



National Committee on Uniform Traffic Control Devices

13236 North 7th Street, Suite 4-259, Phoenix, Arizona 85022
Phone/Text: 231-4-NCUTCD (231-462-8823)
E-mail: secretary@ncutcd.org Website: <https://ncutcd.org>

Item No.: 24A-RW-01

NCUTCD PROPOSAL FOR CHANGES TO THE MANUAL ON UNIFORM TRAFFIC CONTROL DEVICES

COMMITTEE / TASK FORCE: RW Technical Committee
ITEM NUMBER: 24A-RW-01
TOPIC: No Turn on Red (R10-11 Series) Signs
ORIGIN OF REQUEST: RW Task Force; (Lee Roadifer-chair, Bob Seyfried, Doug Bartlett, Tim Haagsma, Natalie Sistrunk, Scott Leary)
AFFECTED SECTIONS OF MUTCD: Section 2B.60

DEVELOPMENT HISTORY:

Approved by RWSTC: 02/13/2024
Approved by RWSTC following sponsor comments: MM/DD/YYYY
Approved by NCUTCD Council: MM/DD/YYYY

This is a proposed change to the MUTCD that has been developed by a technical committee or joint task force of the NCUTCD. The NCUTCD is distributing it to its sponsoring organizations for review and comment. Sponsor comments will be considered in revising the proposal prior to NCUTCD Council consideration. This proposal does not represent a revision of the MUTCD and does not constitute official MUTCD standards, guidance, or options. If approved by the NCUTCD Council, the recommended changes will be submitted to FHWA for consideration for inclusion in a future MUTCD revision. The MUTCD can be revised only through the federal rulemaking process.

SUMMARY:

We propose that the paragraph 01 standard language in Section 2B.60 (Section 2B.54 in 2009 Edition) and the sign designations for the No Turn on Red (R10-11 Series) signs be reverted back to the original 2009 MUTCD language and sign designations.

DISCUSSION:

The 2009 MUTCD sign designations regarding No Turn on Red (R10-11 Series) signs were as follows:



29
30 Paragraph 01 of Section 2B.54 of the 2009 MUTCD stated the following:
31 **Standard:**

32 01 **Where a right turn on red (or a left turn on red from a one-way street to a one-way**
33 **street) is to be prohibited, a symbolic NO TURN ON RED (symbolic circular red) (R10-**
34 **11) sign (see Figure 2B-28) or a NO TURN ON RED (R10-11a, R10-11b) word message**
35 **sign (see Figure 2B-28) shall be used.**
36

37 Figure 2B-27 that accompanied the NPA text incorrectly showed the proposed R10-11 Series
38 signs designations as follows:



39
40 In the NPA, FHWA proposed, under Item 100 of the docket, regarding Section 2B.61 of the NPA
41 Version (Section 2B.54 in the 2009 Version), to change the designations of the No Turn on Red
42 signs such that the word only message signs designated R10-11 and 10-11a and the NO
43 TURN ON RED with the symbolic circular red sign designated as R10-11b. FHWA proposed
44 this change to designate consecutively the word only message sign designations. That proposal
45 was flawed because the 2009 version already had the word message signs designated
46 consecutively as R10-11a and R10-11b.
47

48 A number of commenters to the docket rightfully disagreed with changing the R10-11 sign
49 series designations; and in the Supplemental Summary of Dispositions for Final Rule Changes,
50 FHWA agreed with those commenters to not change the designation of the No Turn on Red
51 sign with the symbolic circular red to R10-11b. However, the error in the figure was retained and
52 therefore the sign designations were changed from the 2009 Edition, contrary to both the wishes
53 of the commenters and the stated intent of the FHWA for proposing the changes to the
54 designations in the first place.
55

56 In the Supplemental Summary of Dispositions for Final Rule Changes, FHWA goes on to adopt
57 changes to the paragraph 01 NPA language because editorial revisions were requested by
58 commenters to clarify the use of the different varieties of No Turn on Red signs. A concerted
59 search of the 17k+ comments to the docket by members of this task force failed to find a docket
60 comment requesting clarification of the use of the different varieties of No Turn on Red signs.
61

62 FHWA modified the standard for use of the No Turn on Red (R10-11 Series) signs to require a
63 word message sign where a right turn on a circular red signal indication (or a left turn on a
64 circular red signal indication from a one-way street to a one-way street) is to be prohibited. It

65 goes on to require the use of the symbolic circular red sign when the approach is controlled by
66 both circular red and red arrow indications. To a practitioner, using the symbolic circular red sign
67 on a right turn lane controlled by a signal head with a Red Arrow indication seems to be
68 counterintuitive. In addition, why is the symbolic circular red sign not appropriate at approaches
69 controlled by circular red signal indications?
70

71 Even if there were comments requesting clarification of the use of the different varieties of No
72 Turn on Red signs, the change in this text (requiring the use of certain signs under certain
73 conditions) was done without public review or explanation, and it was clearly not properly vetted
74 through the traffic control professionals who are obligated to comply with the MUTCD standards.
75 If clarification of the use of the various No Turn on Red signs is needed, a suitable solution for
76 revision should be determined through proper research and adopted through the normal
77 MUTCD revision process.
78

79 Based on these findings, the changes made to Paragraph 01 of Section 2B.60 (2009 Edition
80 Section 2B.54) and Figure 2B-28 (2009 Edition Figure 2B-27) regarding the designations of the
81 R10-11 Series signs appear to have been made in error. Therefore FHWA should publish the
82 corrections in their list of known errors, reverting both back to the 2009 language and sign
83 designations. If FHWA is unwilling to do that, the Task Force recommends making the
84 followings changes to Section 2B.60 of the 2023 MUTCD with the next revision:
85

86 **RECOMMENDED MUTCD CHANGES:**

87 The following present the proposed changes to the current MUTCD within the context of the
88 current MUTCD language. Proposed additions to the MUTCD are shown in blue underline and
89 proposed deletions from the MUTCD are shown in ~~red strikethrough~~. Changes previously
90 approved by NCUTCD Council (but not yet adopted by FHWA) are shown in green double
91 underline for additions and ~~green double strikethrough~~ for deletions. In some cases,
92 background comments may be provided with the MUTCD text. These comments are indicated
93 by bracketed white text in shaded green. Deletions made by a technical committee or task
94 force after initial distribution to sponsoring organizations are shown in ~~highlighted red~~
95 ~~strikethrough and Helvetica text~~. Additions made by a technical committee or task force after
96 initial distribution to sponsoring organizations are shown in underline blue and Helvetica text.
97

98 [The NCUTCD Council recommends Section 2B.60 paragraph 01 language and the R10-11 series sign
99 designations revert back to the 2009 Edition language, with editorial changes to reflect the correct Figure
100 and to retain the 2009 Edition sign designations as follows (clean version for clarity):]

101 **Section 2B.60 No Turn on Red Signs (R10-11 Series, R10-17a, and R10-30)**

102 **Standard:**

103 ⁰¹ **Where a right turn on red (or a left turn on red from a one-way street to a one-way street) is to**
104 **be prohibited, a symbolic NO TURN ON RED (symbolic circular red) (R10-11) sign (see Figure 2B-**
105 **28) or a NO TURN ON RED (R10-11a, R10-11b) word message sign (see Figure 2B-28) shall be**
106 **used.**

107 [The NCUTCD Council recommends correcting Figure 2B-28 to retain the 2009 Edition sign
108 designations as follows:]



R10-11



R10-11a



R10-11b

[Marked up version of the 11th Edition language is shown below to show the necessary changes:]

Section 2B.60 No Turn on Red Signs (R10-11 Series, R10-17a, and R10-30)

Standard:

01 Where a right turn on ~~a circular~~ red ~~signal indication~~ (or a left turn on ~~a circular~~ red ~~signal indication~~ from a one-way street to a one-way street) is to be prohibited, a symbolic NO TURN ON RED (symbolic circular red) (R10-11, ~~R10-11b~~) ~~word message~~ sign (see Figure 2B-28) ~~shall be used.~~ ~~A or a~~ NO TURN ON RED (~~symbolic circular red~~) (R10-11a, R10-11b) word message sign (see Figure 2B-28) shall be used ~~when the approach is controlled by both circular red and red arrow indications.~~

[The rest of 11th Edition Section 2B.60 is included below for context.]

Guidance:

02 *If used, the No Turn on Red sign should be installed near the appropriate signal head.*

03 *A No Turn on Red sign should be considered when an engineering study finds that one or more of the following conditions exists:*

- A. *Inadequate sight distance to vehicles approaching from the left (or right, if applicable);*
- B. *Geometrics or operational characteristics of the intersection that might result in unexpected conflicts;*
- C. *An exclusive pedestrian or bicycle phase;*
- D. *An unacceptable number of conflicting pedestrian movements with right-turn-on-red maneuvers, especially involving children, older pedestrians, or persons with disabilities;*
- E. *More than three right-turn-on-red crashes reported in a 12-month period for the particular approach; or*
- F. *The skew angle of the intersecting roadways creates difficulty for drivers to see traffic approaching from their left (or right, if applicable).*

Standard:

04 **If an R10-11, R10-11a, R10-11b, or R10-17a sign with conventional road size as shown in Table 2B-1 is used on an approach on the far side of the intersection and the distance between the stop line and the sign is greater than 120 feet, then a duplicate sign shall be located on the near side of the intersection to supplement the sign on the far side of the intersection.**

Option:

05 When a no-turn-on-red restriction applies during certain time periods only, the following alternatives may be used:

- A. Movement Prohibition (R3-1, R3-2, R3-4, R3-18, and R3-27) signs or NO TURN ON RED signs displayed by using a blank-out sign for the time period or one or more portion(s) of a particular cycle of the traffic control signal during which the prohibition is applicable; or
- B. Static signs incorporating a supplemental legend or with a supplemental R10-20aP plaque (see Figure 2B- 28) showing the hours and days during which the prohibition is applicable.

06 White LEDs may be used in the border and activated during periods of turn prohibition to enhance the sign conspicuity.

151 07 On signalized approaches with more than one right-turn lane, a NO TURN ON RED EXCEPT FROM
152 RIGHT LANE (R10-11c) sign (see Figure 2B-28) may be post-mounted at the intersection or a NO
153 TURN ON RED FROM THIS LANE (with down arrow) (R10-11d) sign (see Figure 2B-28) may be
154 mounted over the approximate center of the lane from which turns on red are prohibited.

155 *Guidance:*

156 08 *Where turns on red are permitted and the signal indication is a steady RED ARROW, the RIGHT*
157 *(LEFT) ON RED ARROW AFTER STOP (R10-17a) sign (see Figure 2B-28) should be installed adjacent*
158 *to the RED ARROW signal indication.*

159 *Option:*

160 09 A RIGHT TURN ON RED MUST YIELD TO U-TURN (R10-30) sign (see Figure 2B-28) may be
161 installed to remind road users that they must yield to conflicting U-turn traffic on the street or highway
162 onto which they are turning right on a red signal after stopping.

163